Mastering the Review Process: Writing and Responding to Peer-Reviews

This version: 2023-1

Course instructors
Name: Prof. Dr. Jens Foerderer
Room: L230, Heilbronn Campus
Tel.: +49 7131 264 18 802
Mail: office.cdt@wi.tum.de
Web: https://www.wi.tum.de/prof-dr-foerderer

Application procedure

Goal and target audience
The course will be held online via Zoom.

The course is offered for doctoral candidates and post-docs at TUM, who conduct research in the field of business, economics, psychology, political science, sociology, or adjacent fields. Participants of other universities can be accepted for the course if capacity permits.

Each participant requires a working paper for participation, which will be peer-reviewed by another course participant.

FAQ: Which paper should I submit for the course?
- You should be interested in developing your paper. This is given if your paper is part of your dissertation, or if you intend to publish it in a scientific journal or in the proceedings of a conference.
- All types of papers are welcome – including literature reviews, theoretical papers, and empirical papers.
- It is not necessary to submit a fully complete paper. Nevertheless, it must be at least 5,000 words long. Empirical papers must at least report some (early) findings.
- There are no formatting requirements for the working paper.
- It is not possible to submit your paper after the first course day. This is because your paper will be distributed on the first course day for peer-review.

Application process
- Please send an e-mail to the above email address with a registration request that (1) includes your name, (2) the title of your paper (see Assessment), and (3) your TUM-eMail-Address.
- No late enrollment: Registration after the deadline is not possible.

Application deadline: October 6, 2023
Course aims

What this course is
The course provides an overview of the peer-review process in international scientific journals in business (i.e., submission procedures and requirements, editorial decisions, hierarchies). It offers guidance regarding how to write constructive reviews (i.e., generic template for a review, review expectancies for different outlets and different publication stages, serving as a discussant) and equips participants with tools and information how to analyze reviews which they received on their papers (i.e., identifying and aggregating received comments etc.). In addition, the course prepares participants with tools and information on how to respond to reviews (i.e., writing a response note). We will talk about strategies for answering reviewer comments, setting priorities, and getting into a constructive mindset. Various examples illustrate the topics. Finally, you will receive in-depth feedback on your paper by the participants.

It is recommended to participate in this course if you wish to receive feedback on your own work, if you expect to be or are involved as a reviewer for journals and conferences, or if you are currently in the review process with a paper.

What this course is not
The course not limited to a specific research field (e.g., management, finance) but instead provides discipline-spanning recommendations for navigating the peer-review process.

Course objectives

Knowledge Objectives
After the course, participants understand the basic concepts of the publication process in international scientific journals in business. They will understand general concerns that reviewers might have as well as the steps to follow in order to develop papers based on reviews. This also includes strategies on how to respond to reviews.

Skills Objectives
Participants get to know how to write a constructive review for a scientific paper and acquire best practices in responding to reviews. Further, they acquire the ability to analyze reviews they received for their papers. To support the participants in doing so, they are equipped with templates for writing and responding to reviews.

Learning Objectives
Participants learn how scientific work is evaluated by reviewing others’ papers and getting feedback on the own work. Based on these insights participants learn how to communicate their research and how to develop research based on reviews. In addition, participants will get to know how to interpret reviews and how to react to them. This helps the participants in improving their papers and contribute to cutting-edge research.

Preliminary schedule
Course will be held online-only via Zoom. Login details will be distributed after registration.

06.10.2023, 23:59:59: Registration deadline
12.10.2023, 09:00-16:00: Presentation by instructor
30.11.2023, 09:00-16:30: Presentation day 1
Core readings

Course procedures
The course provides practical examples from real peer review processes.

- The course starts with an **introductory presentation** by the instructor on the foundations of the peer-review process, best practices, evaluation criteria, and templates for writing reviews, and best practices, evaluation criteria, and templates for responding to reviews.
- Afterwards, participants start the **peer-review**. Each participant writes one peer review for the paper of one other participant (2-3 pages).
- After receiving the review for their own paper, participants present their review response and discuss it with the class.

Assessment
The course is assessed 100 % through the final presentation.

**Attendance policy:** Participation in all sessions is mandatory. Attendance will be checked. Absences due to health issues will be excused.

Workload
3 ECTS (21 hours lectures, 90 hours total workload)