



Communicating Management Research: (Re)writing Introductions

This version: 26.11.2023

Credits

This syllabus draws on fantastic PhD course syllabi by Oliver Alexy and Damon Philipps. Moreover, I designed the structure based on inspirations from seminars I took part in myself, such as by Jay Barney, Ezra Zuckerman and Roberto Fernandez.

Course instructors

Name: Amy Zhao-Ding, Ph.D.

Room: 2014 (Entrepreneurship Center in Garching, Lichtenbergstr. 6)

Tel.: +49 (0) 89 289 52803

e-mail: amy.zhaoding@tum.de



Course description

Goal

This course is designed to help (in particular) junior scholars in the field of management gain exposure and experience with techniques on the written communication of academic work, specifically, how to write interesting and important introductions. The course requires reading and the discussion of readings, but it is fundamentally a “learning-by-doing” course. I hope to have you undergo an iterative process where you a) communicate your research, b) receive feedback, c) revise your communication, and then cycle through this process again in your own journey. The goal of this course is to start you on the path of being a great communicator of your research and increase the odds of publishing in a top journal. Here, top journal implies *primarily* the “Top 6” (AMJ, AMR, ASQ, ManSci, OrgSci, SMJ), the leading journals in other disciplines (e.g., AJS, ASR, MISQ, Nature, Science...), and also, though to a lesser degree, top field journals that are often part of the “FT 50” – a list of 50 strong management journals listed by the Financial Times. The central question for publishing in these top journals is, usually, how can I make a “theoretical contribution?” Therefore, this course aims to help you clarify your core ideas and craft the introduction so that you articulate the contribution.

Target audience, capacity, and selection criteria

We cordially invite applications from doctoral students and post-docs who strive to publish in the leading of our discipline and their field. To take the most out of this course, we highly recommend you bring a working paper draft. At the very least, you will need a well-developed research idea that you will be able to develop into some form of paper draft as part of the course. Given this course will be highly interactive and feature intense, personal coaching, seating will be limited max 10 people. In case we should receive more applications than we have seats, preference will be given to candidates with more advanced papers (e.g., R&Rs) in particular in the Top 6; those working in areas that we have expertise (roughly speaking: firm-level qualitative, quantitative, or conceptual papers fitting into the TIM, STR, OMT, or ENT divisions of the Academy of Management); and, in



particular, individuals who have received prior training in theory, theorizing, methodology, the philosophy of science, and/or academic writing.

Application Process

Please sign up for the course via email to amy.zhaoding@tum.de by **January 9, 2024**, with your up-to-date academic resume and the full manuscript you wish to discuss during the course. Your paper needs to be empirical. Also email me if you have any questions regarding the course.

Course objectives

Knowledge Objectives

In this course, we strive to help you see what it takes to make a meaningful contribution that advances management scholarship broadly. In doing so, you should not only master your understanding of what “theory” and “contribution” are, but a clearer picture of the process by which they are created and evaluated.

Skills Objectives

- Improve diagnostic, analytical, and verbal skills via class and group discussions
- Enhance critical thinking and interpretation skills
- Build-up or improve writing and review(er)-management skills

Learning Objectives

At the end of this course, students will be able to demonstrate understanding, critical assessment and application of the following:

- How to clearly convey that a paper is interesting and articulate the theoretical contribution
- How to interpret and incorporate reviewer comments in revisions

Preliminary Schedule

All courses take place online, from 9:30am-5:45pm (changes subject to the number of students enrolled). Below are the dates and topics for the sessions, please see “Course Outline” for details on each session’s content and required preparations.

Session	Date	Topic
1	31.01.2024	What makes good theory? The clarification of ideas
2	02.02.2024	How to make a contribution? The craft of introduction: I
3	07.02.2024	How to make a contribution? The craft of introduction: II

Assessment

For participants, the course will be worth 3 ECTS. Given the completely interactive nature of this course, attendance and participation are mandatory, and not properly excused absence or poor preparation may likely lead to your being excluded from the course. Note also how you will be pass-fail graded on this course based on four elements, *all of which* you need to pass:

- Your assignments for all three sessions:
 - Reaction paper (1 page, single space) for the readings in session 1, by **January 30, 2024**
 - The first draft of introduction for the paper presented in session 1, by **January 30, 2024**
 - Feedback for 2 other colleagues’ introductions, by **February 6, 2024**



- The revised, second draft of introduction, by **February 6, 2024**
- Your paper presentation in session 1
- Your participation and interaction throughout the course

Course outline

Session 1 (January 31, 2024). What makes good theory? The clarification of ideas

- Readings (each person leads the discussion of 1-2 paper)
 - Davis, M. 1971. **That's interesting!** *Philosophy of the Social Sciences*, 1: 309-344.
 - Bartunek, J. M., Rynes, S. L., & Ireland, R. D. 2006. **What Makes Management Research Interesting, and Why Does it Matter?** *Academy of Management Journal*, 49(1): 9–15.
 - Tihanyi, L. 2020. **From “That’s Interesting” to “That’s Important”**. *Academy of Management Journal*, 63, 329–331
 - Bacharach, S.B. 1989. **Organizational theories: Some criteria for evaluation**. *Academy of Management Review*, 14: 496 – 515
 - Sutton, R.I., Staw, B.M. (1995). **What theory is not**. *Administrative Science Quarterly* 40: 371-384
 - Weick, K. 1995. **What theory is not, theorizing is**. *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 40: 385-390.
 - DiMaggio, P. 1995. **Comments on “what theory is not.”** *Administrative Science Quarterly*, 40: 391-397.
 - Zuckerman, E.W. 2008. **Tips for article writers**. https://mitgmtfaculty.mit.edu/esivan/reviews_essays/
 - Zuckerman, E.W. 2017. **On Genre: A Few More Tips to Article-Writers**. https://mitgmtfaculty.mit.edu/esivan/reviews_essays/
 - Johanson, L. M. (2007). **Sitting in Your Reader’s Chair: Attending to Your Academic Sensemakers**. *Journal of Management Inquiry*, 16(3), 290–294.
(see <https://asqblog.com/2015/04/29/behind-the-scenes-with-asq-managing-editor-linda-johanson/> for an interview with the author)
 - *Administrative Science Quarterly* Editorial Office, 2017. **Writing tips for ASQ submissions**. <https://asqblog.com/2017/11/22/thanksgiving-special-writing-tips-for-asq-submissions/>
 - Barney, J. 2018. **Editor’s Comments: Positioning a Theory Paper for Publication**. *Academy of Management Review*, 43, 345–348
 - Alvesson, M. & Sandberg, J. 2011. **Generating Research Questions Through Problematization**. *Academy of Management Review*, 36, 247–271
- Submit a reaction paper (1 page, single space) for the readings by **January 30**, think about the connections between the papers and identify challenges to use these principles in paper writing
 - We will discuss the readings in class
- Present a paper (15min presentation + 5min Q&A each), preferably send the slides to me by **January 30**

Session 2 (February 2, 2024). How to make a contribution? The craft of introduction: I

- Bring in 2 exemplar introductions published in academic journals, one to emulate on structure and one related to your content, share with everyone by **February 1**
- Send the first draft of introduction for the paper presented to everyone by **February 1**
 - We will discuss exemplar introductions in the context of your introductions



- We will discuss each introduction in class to clarify the core argument and crystalize the contribution of the papers

Session 3 (February 7, 2024). How to make a contribution? The craft of introduction: II

- Submit feedback about assigned others' introductions by **February 6**
- Submit revised, second draft of introduction by **February 6**
 - We will evaluate progress of the second draft and check against the feedback
 - We will try to further improve some of the introductions together